

Present: J. Tomberlin (Chair)
J. Ahmad (Econ.), K. Argheyd (Mana.), D. Cameron (Mana.),
A-M. Croteau (DS&MIS), U. de Brentani (Mktg.), A. Dhillon (CGSA),
A. Fagnoli (Reg.), R. Ferguson (MBA), S. Fontaine (Staff), J. Freed
(Fina.), M. Genova (Staff), S. K.Goyal (DS&MIS), N. Howe (SGS),
A. B. Ibrahim (Assoc. Dean), D. Kira (DS&MIS), R. Knitter (Mana.),
K. Laframboise (DS&MIS), I. Leduc (CASA) M. Magnan (Assoc. Dean),
J. McConnell (CASA), D. Morin (Assoc. Dean), S. Mustafa (Acco.),
F. Nebebe (DS&MIS), R. J. Oppenheimer (Mana.), D. Peltier-Rivest
(Acco.), M. Perugini (CASA), I. Rakita (Fina.), Sourav Ray (Mktg.), A.
Robin (CASA), S. Robinson (Acco.), M. Sharma (DS&MIS), K. Soufani
(Fina.), C. Y. Suen (Comp. Sci.), M. Thakor (Mktg.), M-E Turcotte
(CASA), M. Wou (CASA)

Guests: K. Boulos (EC), T. Flouris (AMBA), A. Hochstein (GIIM), K. Nolan (Reg.),
W. Taylor (EMBA), D. Wright (Reg.), E. Xenos (IR&C)

Absent with regret: T. Alameddine (CASA), C. Bayne (DS&MIS), O. Bodur (Mktg.),
P. Bolla (Facil.), G. Fisher (Econ.), E. Gatbonton (TESL),
J. Lightstone (Provost), G. Lowenfeld (Acco.), F. Lowy (Rector),
G. Lypny (Fina.), T. O'Connell (Mana.), K. Chin Quee (CGSA),

Call to Order

The meeting was called to order at 09:35.

II Closed Meeting

[illegible]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

III Open Meeting

IV Approval of Agenda - JMSB-2003-06A

It was moved by A. Robin and seconded by M. Sharma that Council approve the agenda. The motion was carried unanimously.

V Approval of the Minutes - JMSB-2003-05M

It was moved by M. Sharma and seconded by S. Goyal that the minutes of the Council meeting held September 26, 2003 be approved with the following amendment and condition:

Amendment: Add F. Nebebe to the Absent with Regrets list;

Condition: page 3, article IX, discussion of cheating, verify from the tape recording of the Council proceedings that U. De Brentani proposed a committee to replace the subjective recommendations of the Associate Dean, Graduate Programs, Research and Program Evaluation regarding Code of Conduct violations and suggested that the JMSB sanctions appear in the university calendars. The motion was carried unanimously.

The importance of addressing the increase in cheating in the University and the reported reversal of Faculty sanctions by the Appeals procedures was strongly emphasized.

It was agreed that future minutes would list all members absent.

VI Chair's Report and Question Period (*maximum 15 minutes*)

J. Tomberlin announced the success in recent rankings and media coverage of the John Molson School of Business:

- . The Economist Intelligence Unit ranked the JMSB MBA 96th of the top 100 worldwide and 5th in Canada full-time MBA programs based on student and alumni surveys.

- . The Wall Street Journal ranked the JMSB in the top 100 business schools for 2004 based on recruiter feedback.

- . The Forbes survey ranked the JMSB 18th among international schools and 5th in Canada based on an analysis of the internal investment for full-time MBA students.

- . The Financial Times ranked the EMBA program 40th in the world and 3rd in Canada

- . The last issue of Canadian Business commented on niche programs noting the JMSB Aviation and Investment Management programs as well as giving us top billing for our new building

He reported that the Ken Woods Portfolio Management Program celebrated the induction of seven new Calvin C. Potter Fellows on Thursday, October 23; the official launch of the Sebastian Van Berkow Endowed Chair in Small Cap Finance and the

celebration of the appointment of L. Switzer as Chair will take place on Tuesday, November 25; and the annual Awards of Distinction ceremony is scheduled on Monday, November 17.

With regard to cheating, J. Tomberlin announced that the JMSB has purchased a license for a software package called "Turn it in" which analyzes papers and term projects to determine if plagiarism has occurred. Some legal issues must be resolved concerning informing students. Partial operation will begin during the winter term with full operation expected for the 2004-2005 academic year.

With regard to the strategic planning process mentioned at the September meeting of Council, J. Tomberlin advised that discussions conducted by P. L. Kelley, Executive in Residence, Department of Management and M. Vadalchino de Massey, from the Board of Governors, were ongoing. He encouraged everyone to attend the meetings they have been assigned or if there is an irresolvable conflict, to call and make arrangements to attend another meeting. In January and early February some part-time faculty, students and staff members will be interviewed to include their input to the draft strategic plan to be prepared in mid-February.

In closing, he advised that in response to the Steering Committee's request that the fifteen-minute time limit for questions to the Chair be observed, the use of a timer will be initiated. A motion of Council would be required to extend the question period beyond fifteen minutes.

In reply to a question about the new software, he confirmed that students would be required to submit their work electronically. To offset printing charges for hard copy corrections and comments, students would be asked to submit papers both in hard copy and electronically.

VII Elections – There were no elections.

VIII Business Arising from Previous Meeting

- i) John Molson Executive Centre (formerly Executive Development Programs)
Report - JMSB-2003-05A-09 and JMSB-2003-05A-09 addendum
It was moved by A.-M. Croteau and seconded by D. Morin that Council grant speaking privileges to K. Boulos, Director, John Molson Executive Centre.
The motion was carried unanimously.

K. Boulos reported that his mandate was to reposition the programs from operations style offerings to those having synergies with the courses offered in the JMSB. It is hoped that this shift will prove to be profitable within the coming year. He suggested that a time limit for turning a surplus rather than a deficit should be established. Efforts in progress include collaboration with CIT, the development of a new website designed by Marketing Communications, contact with external agencies to assist with direct mail cost effectiveness, and the use of marketing firms for advertising and the layout of promotional materials.

One faculty member expressed concern about the short-term six-month plan and the absence of a Director to handle the marketing functions for the period between the start date of K. Boulos and the departure of the previous director. She indicated that there was a continual need for someone to recruit students despite the status of the Director. With regard to the former, K. Boulos advised that a three-year forecast was presented to Council late last year. With regard to the latter, it was noted that Associate Dean Magnan oversaw the operation during this period, however, the issue of continual recruitment of clients still needs to be addressed as the Director now handles most marketing responsibilities. With regard to recruitment, K. Boulos pointed out that customized courses that earn larger returns would be the focus of marketing efforts with the goal of reversing the 80 – 20 ratio and becoming self-sufficient in one year with the assistance of added sales-oriented staff.

With regard to the increase in Office Labour despite what appears to be a decrease in staff, it was explained that the 2003 figures do not include the salaries of the director and one staff member for a four-month period.

It was suggested that repositioning be tied in to recruitment of new faculty and coordinated with core departmental competencies. It was also suggested that the expertise of the Department of Marketing in the area of direct marketing be explored.

It was moved by M. Sharma and seconded by S. Ray that Council receive the report of the John Molson School of Business, JMSB-2003-05A-09.

The motion was carried unanimously.

- ii) Goodman Institute of Investment Management Report - JMSB-2003-06A-01
It was moved by D. Morin and seconded by K. Laframboise that Council grant speaking privileges to A. Hochstein, Director, Goodman Institute of Investment Management.
The motion was carried unanimously.

A. Hochstein highlighted the report, the goals of the program - the incorporation of the MBA and the CFA designation; the logistics of course delivery; and the success rate of the JMSB students. He thanked all who have helped make the program a success: the students, the professors in the program, Lucy Wong, Susan Cartman, Marilyn Steinkopf in Toronto, Rob Roth in Montreal, Mary Genova, Khaled Soufani, Ian Rakita, Associate Deans Morin and Ibrahim and the Dean.

With regard to the budget, A. Hochstein confirmed that the renovations were paid from the Goodman fund and the increase in labour can be attributed to the expansion of the staff in Toronto.

It was moved by M. Sharma and seconded by K. Laframboise that Council receive the report of the Goodman Institute of Investment Management as presented in document JMSB-2003-06A-01.

In response to concern that the enrolment projection was overly optimistic, A. Hochstein advised that it would be realistic in light of the international interest from England and areas of Asia. With regard to a question about the budget figures being audited, Associate Dean Ibrahim gave his assurances controls were in place to monitor the investment in the program. In reply to a question about the maximum enrolment for the program, A. Hochstein advised that forty students, twenty in Montreal and twenty in Toronto, would be the maximum enrolment without any substantial increase in cost. Entry requirements would be raised if demand became too great.

The motion was carried unanimously.

iii) **Entrepreneurship Institute for the Development of Minority Communities - JMSB-2003-05A-11**

On behalf of C. Bayne, B. Ibrahim offered to respond to any questions regarding the report. An addendum to the report indicating the cumulative financial performance from 1999 – 2003 was distributed to Council members.

It was moved by S. Goyal and seconded by S. Robinson that Council receive the report of the Entrepreneurship Institute for the Development of Minority Communities as presented in document JMSB-2003-05A-11.

A breakdown of the financing for the Black, African and Caribbean Communities was requested. B. Ibrahim advised that a cheque in the amount of \$120,000 had just been received to cover the cost of paying faculty who taught in the program, approximately \$40,000 - \$45,000 and leaving a small surplus. The surplus for all programs under the umbrella of the EIDMC was \$104,500 that has been used to purchase computer equipment for the doctoral program and the refurbishment of the M.Sc. lab inasmuch as the JMSB has no budget for supporting these programs. Additionally some of the surplus would be spent to promote further activities in the community. In reply to a question about a possible deficit in a program, B. Ibrahim advised that the program has an entrepreneurial structure that provides no stipend for the Director and no commitments to administrative staff or overhead. He noted that this year over \$600,000 was spent on computers and furniture for the Faculty while our operating budget is approximately \$500 - \$600. Without the money coming mainly from surpluses, from past privatization fees and increases in FTEs we would run in deficit.

One faculty member praised the program for enhancing the reputation of the JMSB with respect to social responsibility as well as making a monetary contribution. Another faculty member noted the radical variance in annual contributions and asked for more detail regarding the expenses incurred in the program suggesting that more detail would lead to better planning rather than what appears to be an ad hoc method of surplus allocation. B. Ibrahim explained that the variance was directly related to the revenue that was based on the number of programs negotiated; more programs bring higher revenues that result in higher surpluses. He suggested that the Program Director be contacted for additional information. It was argued that the report on page 8 was not as informative as that submitted by other programs even it was presented in the

report format approved by Council. It was suggested that the exhibit on page 8 for 2002-2003 be expanded to past years.

The Chair confirmed that the report followed the format recommended by Council although some other programs had provided more detail.

The question was called by D. Peltier-Rivest and seconded by S. Goyal.

24 in favour, 1 opposed, 0 abstentions

The motion was carried (24 in favour, 1 opposed, 0 abstentions)

B. Ibrahim reiterated that the Director would be able to answer further inquiries. The Chair suggested that the format be reviewed and considered by the Steering as a possible agenda item at a later date.

iv) Discussion of Profile of Provost - JMSB-2003-05A-12

One faculty member pointed out that the advertisement did not reflect the profile with respect to French language needs of the candidate. This concern was echoed by another Council member who stated that only an individual who was fluent in both English and French would adequately represent Concordia with CREPUQ and representatives from the Quebec government. It was remarked that Quebec was officially a French environment while Canada was officially a bilingual environment. It was generally agreed that the advertisement did not reflect the Profile of the Ideal candidate and should ideally be re-issued.

It was moved by M. Sharma and seconded by K. Argheyd that Council recommend to the Advisory Search Committee for the Provost and Vice-Rector, Concordia University, that the focus of recruitment be based on the qualifications outlined in the Profile of the Ideal Candidate, particularly with respect to suitable fluency in both English and French to effectively represent Concordia University in a bilingual Quebec environment. The motion was carried unanimously.

IX Report: Graduate Programs, Research and Program Evaluation

i) JMSB-2003-06A-02

With regard to the proposed Procedural Guidelines for Advisory Search Committees for Graduate Program Directorships, it was suggested that page 2, sixth line be revised to read: "Under exceptional circumstances, the Dean may select a GPD on an interim basis without the input of a Search Committee" which would then be followed by a formal search.

D. Morin reported that at the last meeting of the Faculty Academic Programs Committee attended by six Program Directors and four of the five Chairs, the procedures for the selection of Graduate Program Directors were proposed and approved for Council consideration. She noted that there has been no previous procedures established merely a committee composition that was approved by Council in 1996. It was suggested that the sixth item on page 2 be revised to read: Under exceptional circumstances, the Dean may select a GPD on *an interim basis* without the input of a Search Committee.

It was generally agreed that this item would be brought forward to the next meeting of Council after Council members have had the opportunity to reflect on the proposal and send their comments to D. Morin.

It was suggested that the stipend of the Graduate Program Director be made known.

With regard to the on-line C.V. project, N. Paradis was commended for outstanding professionalism. D. Morin extended her thanks to U. De Brentani for her constructive advice on the C.V. structure and content.

- ii) Undergraduate Curriculum Changes – JMSB-2003-06A-03
It was moved by D. Morin and seconded by G. Kanaan that Council approve the Undergraduate Curriculum revisions as presented in document JMSB-2003-06A-03.

D. Morin briefly outlined the revisions.

The motion was carried unanimously.

X Standing Report on the status of the new JMSB building

On behalf of D. Doreen the Chair reported that the plans posted on the website do not reflect up-to-date revisions that are not yet available in an electronic format. The main revisions, that will be posted as soon as an electronic version is prepared by the architects, include: the reception areas for departments will be separated more with entrances clearly distinguished in the shared waiting area; the MBA reception area will no longer be shared with the CIT reception area, the CIT entrance will move to a less public areas suitable to the internal clientele; the dining area of the executive floors has undergone major revisions to assure enough space for catered receptions of up to 150 persons similar to the facilities of the Hall building Faculty Club; the top floor has been reconfigured to accommodate the Office of the Associate Dean, External Affairs and provide a closed area for the staff of the Dean's Office as well as space for the confidential faculty personnel files.

J. Tomberlin reported that the Building Committee was now engaged in "Value Engineering", an exercise that attempts to reduce the costs by \$2.5 million. To date consultants have been hired for: dining and catering facilities; security – electronic cards are being considered for some parts of the building; acoustics; AV and IT needs for classrooms.

In response to a question about the directional position of the plan the Chair advised that the entrance was on the north-west corner of Guy. He agreed to have the plan indicate the street names and to eliminate the thirteenth floor if it was a concern to the occupants. With regard to the faculty offices not being identified by department names, he stated that there would be enough offices for all faculty members and advised that office allocations would be made prior to the move. In response to a question about faculty offices being allocated by department, he advised that decisions would be made at a later date. He agreed to ask the Building Committee about moving faculty

members' books in light of the Laval University experience where there was strong concern that the new structure would not support the weight of the books.

- XI CASA Report - JMSB-2003-06A-04
The report was distributed and received by Council members. A. Robin highlighted the report and noted that the results of the CASA by-elections would be announced on November 3rd.
- XII Report: External Affairs and Executive Programs – There was no report.
- XIII Report: Administrative Affairs and Human Resources – There was no report.
- XIV Report: Undergraduate Programs, Academic and Student Affairs – There was nothing to report.
- XV Reports from School Representatives on University Committees
i) University Senate
ii) Arts and Science Faculty Council
iii) Senate Academic Planning and Priorities
iv) Senate Academic Programs Committee
v) Senate Research Committee
vi) University Library Committee – Nothing to Report
vii) Undergraduate Scholarships and Awards Sub-committee
M. Sharma reported that CASA representative M. Perugini and Assistant to the Associate Dean, Undergraduate Programs, M. Salari were awarded scholarships.

viii) Board of Governors - Nothing to report
ix) Council of the School of Graduate Studies
- XVI CGSA Report - JMSB-2003-06A-05
The report was received. A. Dhillon highlighted the report and thanked Associate Dean Ibrahim and his staff for their help with the CGSA lounge facilities.
- XVII New Business
i) International Aviation MBA Annual Report – JMSB-2003-06A-06
*It was moved by M. Sharma and seconded by A. Robin that Council grant speaking privileges to T. Flouris, Director, International Aviation MBA Program.
The motion was carried unanimously.*

T. Flouris reported that his mandate was the academic and financial restructure of the program based on excellent service to students, the development of strong academic partnerships and the assurance of financial viability with the goal of presenting a balanced budget next year without eroding the quality of program. He reported that there was an increase in enrolment not reflected in Exhibit I of the report resulting from his decision to extend the start date to April 2004 for the GAMBA program. To date the GAMBA program enrolment has increased from 11 to 15, 7 of the 15 students have scholarships and the AMBA program enrolment has increased from 15 last year to 20 this year.

In response to a question regarding the breakeven point for the GAMBA and the AMBA programs, T. Flouris advised that the GAMBA Program break-even would be 11 students paying full price and the AMBA Program break-even would be 9 students paying full price.

In response to a question about the proposed certificate programs cannibalizing other programs, T. Flouris stated that the programs focus on the very specialized aviation industry and would not impact on other graduate certificate programs offered by the JMSB. Industry feedback indicates that the proposed programs would attract management level candidates, from Bombardier for example, who already have a general MBA but want additional education geared to the industry.

In response to a question about the number of scholarships available for the AMBA Program and the GAMBA Program, T. Flouris advised that there was one scholarship for each program designed to attract female candidates who were severely under-represented in the programs.

It was moved by M. Sharma and seconded by K. Laframboise that Council receive the International Aviation MBA Program report as presented in document JMSB-2003-06A-06.
The motion was carried unanimously.

ii) Executive MBA Annual Report – JMSB-2003-06A-07

It was moved by M. Sharma and seconded by K. Argheyd that Council grant speaking privileges to W. Taylor, Director of the Executive MBA Program.
The motion was carried unanimously.

W. Taylor advised that the decrease in enrolment this year can be attributed to the economy in particular the slump in the high tech and aviation industries as well as tough competition including our own programs. It is expected that the Financial Times ranking the JMSB 40th in the world and Queens at 46th would facilitate the recruitment for next year. With regard to the surplus, he explained that the University uses fund accounting so that the first year of the Paris option generated accounts receivables because we are not paid by June 1st. As a consequence while \$140,000 has been reported on a cash basis, there is an unreported asset of \$65,000 that was created during the summer of 2003. On a cash basis, the surplus was \$140,000 but on an accrual basis the surplus was over \$200,000. He projected a surplus of approximately \$30,000 for this year.

With regard to the Paris option, now in the second year of the three-year plan, he advised that there was a loss of only \$12,000 due to the waiver of the JMSB administration fee. The continuation of the program will be discussed this year by the EMBA Committee. W. Taylor noted that inasmuch as the program is costly in terms of time commitment it would be difficult to walk away since the it was now the top ranked EMBA in France.

It was moved by M. Sharma and seconded by A. Robin that Council receive the report of the Executive MBA as presented in document JMSB-2003-06A-07.

The motion was carried unanimously

W. Taylor was congratulated for the EMBA success in the Financial Times rankings.

XVIII Other Business

- i) Notice of motion regarding committee mandates – JMSB-2003-06A-08
This item will be brought forward to the next meeting of Council.

XIX Adjournment

It was moved by M. Sharma and seconded by A. Robin that the meeting be adjourned.

The motion was carried unanimously.

The meeting was adjourned at 12:20

XX Next meeting

The next regular meeting of Council will take place on Friday, November 28, 2003 in room GM302.